

Interactive comment on “Adsorption, desorption and fractionation of As(V) on untreated and mussel shell-treated granitic material” by N. Seco-Reigosa et al.

G. A. Petruzzelli (Referee)

gianniantonio.petruzzelli@ise.cnr.it

Received and published: 16 January 2015

General comments The scientific originality and content of the article largely justify publication in this journal nearly in the present form. This very interesting article deals with the utilization of different byproducts as material to adsorb arsenic. This paper, as clearly indicated, is a further contribution on the same topic of a previous papers published by the authors to deepen the retention/release processes of arsenic. The article fall within the aims of the journal, and contains new scientific discovers that are correctly explained. The title reports the important features of the work, and the abstract describes adequately the paper. The article is well structured and organized,

C1507

rich of interesting results, and ideas that bring a noteworthy original contribution to the scientific knowledge in the field of environmental problems related to arsenic pollution.

The work carried out is considerable, the experimental parts are adequately described and include sufficient data from replicated experiments and statistical analysis. All the theories and conclusions, are well supported by the numerous data obtained. All the figures and tables are appropriate. The paper contains many up-to-date references

Specific comments There are some minor remarks

Materials and methods

The nature of the mixture of granitic materials should be explained more in detail. Reference of the analytical methods used are reported for available P, but not for other parameters for example pH, Carbon, Nitrogen, I suggest to add references for all the used methods. **Results and discussion** I feel that it would be better to use “standard deviation” in table 1.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 6, 3419, 2014.

C1508