Solid Earth Discuss., 6, C1511–C1512, 2015 www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/C1511/2015/

© Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Cr(VI) adsorption/desorption on untreated and mussel shell-treated soil materials: fractionation and effects of pH and chromium concentration" by M. Otero et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 21 January 2015

- 1) The paper is poorly typed: for example: absolutely no care was in the use of subsuperscripts, which is most annoying in a paper with chemistry and formulae in it.
- 2) The authors declare to have performed the experiments with three replicates. but not in the figure, nor in the text appears any attempt to show the variability of the measurements. Also no effort was made to make some formal test to substantiate the findings.
- 3) It seems to this referee that the inclusion of pyrite into the pool of examined samples only confuses the reader . In fact its composition, markedly the Fe-related fractions, C1511

is by far very distant from the other sorbents. In other words it can be considered an outlier in the group studied.

4) other comments are directly typed in the attached pdf.

Please also note the supplement to this comment: http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/C1511/2015/sed-6-C1511-2015-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 6, 3393, 2014.