Solid Earth Discuss., 6, C1628–C1629, 2015
www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/C1628/2015/

Solid Earth
Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "Cr(VI) adsorption/desorption on untreated and mussel shell-treated soil materials: fractionation and effects of pH and chromium concentration" *by* M. Otero et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 9 March 2015

This paper describes an experimental approach to the study of Cr sorption/desorption kinetics for different soil materials and acidity. In my opinion, this manuscript falls within the scope of SE. The experiment is well designed, although not well explained. Also, there are some inconsistencies in the text that need deep revision and re-writing. Especially, statistical analysis is very poor. Simple statistics may be applied to the analysis of results, which will improve the interpretation of results and discussion. In the objectives, it is stated that "risks of water pollution and transfer to the food chain" will be analyzed and discussed, but I have not found discussion on this. Just a short

paragraph focused on this aspect should help to give the manuscript a wider scope, in agreement with the journal characteristics. I consider that this manuscript should be of interest, but needs a lot of work (then, conclusions should be perhaps modified). It should be reconsidered after major revision. I have uploaded a separate doc with detailed comments.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/C1628/2015/sed-6-C1628-2015-supplement.pdf

---

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 6, 3393, 2014.