

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Cr(VI) adsorption/desorption on untreated and mussel shell-treated soil materials: fractionation and effects of pH and chromium concentration” by M. Otero et al.

M. Otero et al.

avelino.nunez@usc.es

Received and published: 13 March 2015

Referee #1 1) The paper is poorly typed: for example: absolutely no care was in the use of sub-superscripts, which is most annoying in a paper with chemistry and formulae in it. ANSWER: Thank you for your comment. We are sorry. We don't know the reason of these mistakes regarding subscripts and superscripts. In fact, the version available online corresponding to SED, which is at <http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/3393/2014/sed-6-3393-2014.pdf>, is in the correct format. Any case, now we include a manuscript that we think is correct at this regard.

C1630

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Interactive
Comment

2) The authors declare to have performed the experiments with three replicates. But not in the figure, nor in the text appears any attempt to show the variability of the measurements. Also no effort was made to make some formal test to substantiate the findings. ANSWER: Thank you for your comment. We have added new details at this regard (blue fonts), indicating that coefficients of variation are lower than 5%. If SD or CV bars are included in the figures, data are hard to see, so it discouraged us to present variability that way.

3) It seems to this referee that the inclusion of pyrite into the pool of examined samples only confuses the reader. In fact its composition, markedly the Fe-related fractions, is by far very distant from the other sorbents. In other words it can be considered an outlier in the group studied. ANSWER: Thank you for your comment. We included pyritic material due to its clearly higher Cr retention potential. We really think that it can be of interest to be compared with the other solid substrates analyzed in the manuscript.

4) Other comments are directly typed in the attached pdf. ANSWER: Thank you for all your comments and indications. We have corrected the mistakes and included new information (blue fonts) regarding those points you marked.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/C1630/2015/sed-6-C1630-2015-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 6, 3393, 2014.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper