

Response to comments 3

This manuscript presents an interesting aspect of using furfural and its biochar in soil amendments not so normally found in the literature.

Even I am not a native in English I see that there are several parts of this manuscript that should be improved for a better understanding for potential readers.

There is one point where I want to see clarified and is the type of statistical test applied.

That is my major concern, it is not a good way to apply a one-way ANOVA as they present with these results and I am concerned then about their conclusions. Please, think about the statistical test and improve it.

Answer: Thank you for your kindly review. I felt so sorry for misunderstanding here. In the present study, we focused on the effects of treatments or incubation time on the soil properties. That is we only compare the differences among the treatments at one incubation time or the incubation time at one treatment. And we did not compare them both at the same time. As a result, we think a one-way ANOVA can be OK with this kind of work. At the same time, we also referenced some similar research. For example, Novak (2009) used one-way ANOVA to study the effects of different amounts of biochar on soil properties at one incubation time. Zhang (2012) also used this statistics method to study the gas emissions with different amounts of biochar application. I present more detailed information of the biochar in revised edition.

Article referenced:

Novak, J.M., Busscher, W.J., Laird, D.L., Ahmedna, M., Watts, D.W., Niandou, M.A.S, Impact of biochar amendment on fertility of a Southeastern coastal plain soil. *Soil Science*, 2009, 174:105–112.

Zhang, A., Bian R., Pan G., Cui L., Hussain Q., Li L., Zheng J., Zheng J., Zhang X. and Han X. Effects of biochar amendment on soil quality, crop yield and greenhouse gas emission in a Chinese rice paddy: a field study of 2 consecutive rice growing cycles. *Field Crops Research*, 2012, 127: 153-160.

Xu Gang<sup>b</sup>, Shao Hongbo<sup>a,b\*</sup>

a. Institute of Life Sciences, Qingdao University of Science & Technology, Qingdao 266042, China

b. Yantai Institute of Coastal Zone Research (YIC), Chinese Academy of Sciences (CAS), Yantai 264003, China

Corresponding authors: shaohongbochu@126.com