

## ***Interactive comment on “Nitrogen, phosphorus, potassium, calcium and magnesium release from two compressed fertilizers: column experiments” by M. J. Fernández-Sanjurjo et al.***

**Anonymous Referee #1**

Received and published: 20 July 2014

The manuscript describes an experiment testing the release of elements (N, P, K, Ca and Mg) in soil from controlled-release fertilizer tablets. The experimental design is correct and the research carried out has many implications for agricultural and forest fertilization practices, which is an issue of broad importance. The issue falls within the scope of Solid Earth, in the section of Soil System Science. My recommendation is “minor revision”. I have not any objection to results and conclusions. In contrast, I have some concerns in the first sections of the manuscript. The most important are: [1] In the abstract, the authors should start enouncing the objective of your paper. [2] The Introduction section is well written and the state of art is reviewed satisfactorily. But objectives are enounced in a too general way. I suggest highlighting the relevance of

C693

objectives in the context of the problem and background. [3] The authors commonly refer to “nutrients”. I think that “elements” or “exchangeable cations” may be much more proper terms. [4] The methods section needs some minor revision. Some items are obvious, but require some attention. a. The reference list needs to be revised. I have not exhaustively revised it, but some references are not cited in the main text. Some of them are: IUSS-WRB, 2007; Jiménez-Gomez, 1992; Paramasivam and Alva, 1997. b. In other cases, citations are not correct (e.g. “Sato and Morgan, 2008” is cited as “Sato et al., 2008”). [5] Homogeneous criteria are necessary for chemical terms. It is not acceptable to use Phosphorus and P or Calcium and Ca even in the same sentence (see figure legends, for example).

A separate document with detailed comments has been uploaded.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/6/C693/2014/sed-6-C693-2014-supplement.pdf>

---

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 6, 1555, 2014.