Solid Earth
Discussions

Open Access

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "Short-term grazing exclusion has no impact on soil properties and nutrients of degraded alpine grassland in Tibet, China" *by* X. Lu et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 30 August 2015

Dear authors

Please, find here some comments and suggestions to improve your paper:

-Authors indicate that a period of 6-8 years is considered as a short-term period in the Tibet plateau. However, this number of years can be considered as medium-term or even long-term in other environments. So, it is recommended to explain better this assumption.

-Introduction should be slightly shortened and better focussed on the related topic of the paper.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

-Last paragraph of introduction should be rewritten. Authors should state clearer their hypothesis as well as the objectives (i, ii, iii...).

-Please, write "Climate data" instead of "Climates data". Subsection 2.4.

-Discussion. This section should be rewritten completely. Authors must avoid including again references to results, tables or figures already mentioned in the Result section. Please, just discuss your results, go further and look for the explanations. It is not only a process of comparing your results with others from other investigations.

-Conclusions. This section is currently more a summary of the study than real conclusions. So, it should be rewritten being very concise and replying to the addressed objectives in the introduction: i, ii, iii,...

In general, authors should make an effort to highlight better their findings and their contribution to the knowledge of alpine grassland degradation.

-Figures can be colored drawn.

-Figure 1 is not referenced in the text.

-Figure 2 is not necessary. Authors should delete it and, if so, put in a table the soil particle distribution data.

———————————————————

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 2413, 2015.