

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Effects of soil depth on the dynamics of selected soil properties among the highlands resources of Northeast Wollega, Ethiopia: are these sign of degradation?” by A. Adugna and A. Abegaz

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 31 August 2015

The paper has attempted to address very important issues of land degradation. To improve the paper I have forwarded the following points.

Comment on the title: suggested below

Effects of land use types on selected soil properties dynamics in the highlands of nE wellega, ehtiopia

Abstract:

- Problem (research) is not included in the abstract section.

C1030

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



- Better include the values (quantitative) of the soil parameters

Introduction

Ok.

2. Methodology

- Authors should include Land use map

2 section 2.2 Soil sampling

- The purpose of having 100 m x 100m tiles is not clear. Do you thing such an area is homogenous with in a given land use?

-The purpose of 100 m² with in each tiles and put one on the center and 3 on the arm... is not clear. (How and why?)

-Describe why you prefer to take samples from each sampling plot at five points (north, south, east...)? it is not clear the exact point of sampling using this directions because if you say north how far from the boarder of the plot?

n initial paragraph or section evaluating the overall quality of the discussion paper ("general comments"), followed by a section addressing individual scientific questions/issues ("specific comments"), and by a compact listing of purely technical corrections at the very end ("technical corrections": typing errors, etc.)

- 40 composite samples could be enough to represent such large area unless there is strong justification (20 for surface and 20 samples for subsurface)

- Exactly show using the photograph the plots and points of soil sampling as an example.

- Procedure of soil analysis should be described before you continue to the statistical analysis.

Results and discussion

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



- In your title it says.are these sign of degradation? This is not addressed properly and critically in this paper. The authors should redo it seriously (by presenting results and discussing the results).

Conclusion

- Make it brief and smart.

Fig 3: to me better to put it in table form. Confusing me as a reader.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 2011, 2015.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

