

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Improvements in aggregate stability of recently deposited sediments supplemented with tea waste and farmyard manure” by B. Turgut and B. Köse

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 16 September 2015

The study could be a more contribution to show how different organic waste as can improve an important physical property of soil such as aggregate stability. But in my opinion there are relevant lacks of information to can be considered to be published in a journal as Solid Earth. So, I am sorry that my recommendation is rejection in this current version. If authors think that can solve all lacks I list below, I suggest they will re-submit as a new paper.

Paper and results I think are very short for a regular paper, I suggest being prepared as a Short Communication.

I cannot understand well the election of that sediment for the study, is that sediment a

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



potential material to be used as a soil? Where? In situ? Is necessary that sediment to be restored?

Authors mentioned that sediment can be considered a degraded soil. I disagree, a sediment is a necessary material in a weathering, erosion process, . . . , all this should be discussed more in depth and justified.

In some parts of paper they talk about sediment as the material used, in another places as soil. Can that recent sediment be considered a soil? Please justify and be consistent with the term used in manuscript.

I am not English native speaker but I found many mistakes in English, a native speaker before submission must revise this.

This experiments use 2 types of organic wastes. Where are the analyses of the 2 organic wastes? Their characterization is necessary for this kind of research.

Experimental design: Only 2 replicates per dose and treatment, I think 3 should be the minimum.

Please consider all this comments to improve manuscript and if all these lacks can be solved submit again as a new manuscript

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 2037, 2015.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

