

Interactive comment on “Effects of soil depth on the dynamics of selected soil properties among the highlands resources of Northeast Wollega, Ethiopia: are these sign of degradation?” by A. Adugna and A. Abegaz

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 16 September 2015

This manuscript described a research on the variation of selected soil properties in depth in a region of Ethiopia. In general, I see not much relation between the title and many of results and the discussion. Perhaps, because objectives are not properly enounced. Most of the results look valuable and interesting for the scientific community, but presentation is very poor.

I think that the introduction and methods section need to be highly improved before the manuscript is considered for publication in SE. Only after these sections are re-written, results and discussion should be reviewed (authors may pay attention to these too). At

C1085

this stage, my recommendation is rejection.

These are some general comments: The abstract must be completely revised, briefly stating the studied problem and the specific objectives. The abstract finishes with a brief description of results, but it may include the main conclusions (these, must be also revised in the main text). Abbreviations in the abstract are not explained, as this section must be independent from the main text. Literature review is poor and in some cases, too general references are inadequately used to support certain statements (eg, the first two lines of introduction). Authors must check references through the text and make only adequate citations. Terminology must be homogeneized. For example, about sampling: tile, sub-plots, spots. . . I have found some important problems regarding statistical treatment of data (see below). Results and discussion should be revised after this problem is solved. The quality of English grammar and style is poor. I strongly recommend a deep revision of the text.

Detailed comments are provided separately.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/7/C1085/2015/sed-7-C1085-2015-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 2011, 2015.

C1086