

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Effects of vegetation restoration on the aggregate stability and distribution of aggregate-associated organic carbon in a typical karst gorge region” by F. K. Tang et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 21 October 2015

The aim of the study was to test the effect of land use on the aggregate stability in a karst area from China. This subject is important and falls within the general scope of the journal, but the paper has several problems. There are several limitations in the manuscript related to the organization of the narrative and the experimental design. The introduction must be improved, including specific information on the effect of land use on SOM and aggregate stability which is already found in other countries. In the same way, the methods must also improve. The experimental design is confusing and must be described correctly. Information about land use must be included. Soil char-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



acteristic for each vegetation site are critical for this paper (as SOM contents, texture, pH, CaCO₃ content etc). What about the replicates. There is not information about the fractal technique you mentioned. Improve the reference of the wet-sieving method you used. Apparently, you carried out a field investigation and an indoor experiment. This is not clear. The details about data calculation and analysis are excessive. The results describe the parameter measured without a coherent argument. If the author explained clearly the question, the hypothesis and the experimental design is easier to write clearly the results. The structure should include the two types of studies (field and laboratory). Aggregate SOM contents should be considered before than aggregate stability Finally, the discussion is not clear, in some aspects it is speculative, with repetitive ideas.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 2213, 2015.

SED

7, C1235–C1236, 2015

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

