

Interactive comment on “Does *Jatropha curcas* L. show resistance to drought in the Sahelian zone of West Africa? A case study from Burkina Faso” by P. Bayen et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 11 March 2015

In general: Although the topic of the paper is an interesting and should be told in literature, this paper is in its current form not acceptable for publication in SOIL. See comments below. Abstract: Explain site specific terms, explain statistical terminology and interpret them for the reader, now the reader needs to figure out by themselves what it means. Introduction: In general not bad, although not enough references from Burkina Faso or other Sahelian countries in my opinion. Furthermore, it needs to be rewritten to be more concise and omit repetitions. Especially page 4 needs to be rewritten completely. In addition the authors need to explain already here site specific terms to the reader (e.g. Sudano-Sahelian region) Methods: Please explain why these different types of statistical analysis was needed to assess these data, it seems unnecessary. P

C187

7 line 6: measurements instead of measures. Discussion/References: I think you need to explain the notifications of the statistics that you put in brackets. Not all reader will know what it means, nor will they know if the numbers given to it are good or bad. Some comments are very general. . . really common knowledge (like p 8, line 23-26; page 9, line 7-10) Also the English needs to be revised by an English editor. There are many places where there is strange working, so needs to be rephrased. In addition the paper is very repetitive in what is said. In this very short paper, the authors tell many times about the same things. One thing I really want to stress: the authors mention that all seedlings died due to soil constraints or soil conditions. This really needs explanation, especially in a journal called SOIL. The authors also mention that it is noteworthy that all the plants in the sahel site died and that this may be an indication that it is not so suitable for these conditions. . . . I think you missed a lot of literature on several topics: - Soil and water conservation (see a lot of work of Leo Stroosnijder and his students) - On *Jatropha* in other studies - On soil physics and hydrology - On agronomic studies on survival of plants in relation to water availablitiy Conclusions: a bit repetitious, and anyway should be rewritten after revising the document. Table 1: explain what letters mean in the caption Figures: Make figures all consistent: same font and font size and all border in the same format Fig 1 is nice, but very small font

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 639, 2015.

C188