

Interactive comment on “Recent developments in neutron imaging with applications for porous media research” by A. Kaestner et al.

F. Fusseis (Referee)

florian.fusseis@ed.ac.uk

Received and published: 19 January 2016

Neutron imaging is a fascinating technique that is of significant potential use for an experimental geosciences community, and consequently I was keen to read what Anders and his collaborators have to report in this manuscript.

While the science is great and exciting, the paper under-performs in its presentation. It does read as if it had been rapidly patched together by quite a few contributors and from a several unconnected sources to meet an imminent deadline. There are plenty of imprecise formulations, unsupported statements and subjective phrases. Entire subsections lack a logical structure that lets the reader anticipate what information he/she is going to receive (and why he/she should read them!). In some cases, even the

C1896

citations are incorrectly integrated in the text. Given that all the authors seem very experienced scientists with a substantial track record, this is a pity, and I cannot refrain from emphasizing that it is not the referee's job to correct for English or style.

However, all of the above can be fixed in an afternoon, and consequently all this paper needs to do the reported science justice are minor corrections. I have flagged some of the text that needs attention in the attached pdf.

F Fusseis

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/7/C1896/2016/sed-7-C1896-2016-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 3481, 2015.

C1897