Solid Earth Discuss., 7, C198–C199, 2015 www.solid-earth-discuss.net/7/C198/2015/

© Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



SED

7, C198–C199, 2015

Interactive Comment

## Interactive comment on "Does Jatropha curcas L. show resistance to drought in the Sahelian zone of West Africa? A case study from Burkina Faso" by P. Bayen et al.

## **Anonymous Referee #3**

Received and published: 17 March 2015

This manuscript presents data from performance of Jatropha curcas at two different climatic zones with two different methods of soil restoration. The presented results are important and novel, but I have some concerns about the presentation of the manuscript My first concern has to do with the title. The authors use the term "drought" in the title and I think this term is misused because drought is a prolonged period of abnormally low rainfall. The authors should use a proper term to describe the climatic zone. My second concern has to do with the introduction. The introduction lack consistency and logical linking. The problematic of the research is not well defined. It looks like the authors want to consider soil restoration and Jatropha performance; but the title of the manuscript did not show that. Is Jatropha curcas a pioneer species? Why did you

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



consider it for plantation on barren soil? My third concern has to do with the results and discussion parts. This part is poorly written and need to be more developed. The effects of the treatment on the soil moisture contend was not included in the objectives of the study. You should mention it in the objectives of the study. Overall, I found that this manuscript could be interesting if the authors define clearly the problematic of their study and describe clearly their objectives.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 639, 2015.

## SED

7, C198–C199, 2015

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

