

Interactive comment on “Rapid revegetation by sowing seed mixtures of shrub and herbaceous species” by J. J. Feng et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 25 March 2015

Dear Dr. Antonio Jordán I consider that the subject of the manuscript by Feng et al. is of general interest for a broad audience, in the context of restoration of plant cover in degraded ecosystems with soil erosion risk. Thus, I find the subject of the study interesting and appropriate for Solid Earth. The manuscript is well written, with a clear writing style, the abstract clearly summarize the results of the study, the objectives and hypotheses are clearly stated and the methodology to data analysis seems correct. However, a few aspects should be clarified as you can see below in comments for authors. Therefore, I think that the present form needs some minor revision to improve these points. 1) In the experimental design section, some mention to the steepness of the land where the experimental plots were located is needed, since the plant cover recommended to reduce the risk of erosion depends on the land slope, as authors argue in 2.3 Data collection. . . 2) In the experimental design section authors explain

C232

that 40 plots of 4.5x1.3m were established, but they are 41 if we considered also the control with only shrub, isn't it? 3) It is not clear for me what is the field study made in May 2014 (page 373, 2.3 Data collection). More explanation is needed for me. 4) Why authors have not done any statistical analysis to results sections 3.1, 3.2 and 3.4. The results of these sections are descriptive, very interesting but not supported for any statistical test. 5) In Conclusions, line 3, where authors say “. . . were sowed with herbs. . .” probably they want to say “shrubs”. 6) All captions of tables and figures should be more informative, helping readers to understand any symbol or abbreviation into them without the necessity to go to methods to understand their meaning. For example, in: Table 1. Some chemical properties of the local soil used in the field experiment. Table 3. Average height and ground diameter of *A. fruticosa* (n=15) under different combinations of species and ratios; see Table 2 caption to codes identification. Figure 1. Monthly precipitation (bars) and average temperature (dots) during the experimental period. Figure 2. Total coverage of different combinations of shrub and herbaceous seeds from July to October 2013; see Table 2 caption to codes identification or explain them in the figure caption.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 369, 2015.