Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "*Instaseis*: instant global seismograms based on a broadband waveform database" *by* M. van Driel et al.

D. Al-Attar (Referee)

da380@cam.ac.uk

Received and published: 1 April 2015

General comments:

This paper describes a new approach for the rapid calculation of global seismic wavefields in a spherically symmetric earth model. It is based on the well-established AxiSEM code developed by Nissen-Meyer and colaborators, and the main inovation here is the construction of a database of Green functions which allows wavefields to be rapidly generated for arbitrary source reciever geometries. This is a very useful contribution, and will provide a valuable tool for the seismological community.

The paper is largely concerned with documenting a number of technical issues related to building effecient software for this application. The latter portions then describe in

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

more detail the functionality of the software, and point to some potential applications. For a typical seismologist reading this paper, I would imagine that the initial sections are a little over detailed and "jargony", while it is the later sections which describe potential applications which will hold the most interest. On the whole, I think this is fine, and that the material is worth presenting. I do perhaps wonder if a little could be done to make the initial sections of the paper clearer and more appealing to less computer-literate readers (of whom I count myself).

Specific comments:

1) On pg 964 there is a discusion of how global co-ordinates are mapped to local co-ordinates in the mesh elements. Overall this is well explained and clear. But I did wonder how the code deals with points lying on a material discontinuity of the model. At such points certain derivatives of the wavefield are discontinuous, and so it is necessary to know which side of the boundary the point lies – how is this done?

2) On Pg 965 starting on line 9, a discussion of resampling techniques is given, with several methods mentioned. Though perhaps these methods are elementary, I think it would help to add a few references to this section where further information could be obtained.

3) On pg 966 and 967 there are a number of terms and phrases – presumably coming from computer science – which are not clear to me, and I think further clarification may be needed here. What does "data-source agnostic" mean? And similarly what is "Instaseis is developed with a test-driven approach utilizing continuous integration" meant to convey? I suspect that for people more familar with computer science these will be obvious statements. But given that the potential readership of this paper will mostly be seismologists, I think it would be best to avoid jargon if possibe.

4) On pg 970 line 8, reference is made to "partial memoization". Again I am unfamiliar with this term. It seems likely that this is described within the following text (though this is not completely clear). But even if this is the case, what is gained by using this

technical term?

5) On Pg 972 line 13, it is stated that the computation time of Yspec scales linearly with the number of sources. While this is true for the current implementation, it is not true in principle, and with some more book-keeping the code could be adapted to deal with multiple seismic sources. Perhaps the sentence in the paper could be altered to reflect this limitation of Yspec (and similar codes) is one of implementation, and not a fundamental issue. That being said, I certainly do agree with the general point of the paper that AxiSem produces the whole spatial wavefield, and this feature is a great advantage for producing such databases and for other applications (e.g. kernal computation).

Technical corrections:

1) In the abstract, reference is made to "arbitrary 1-D models or other spherical objects such as Mars". Given that Mars isn't actually a sphere, I wonder if this could be phrased differenty?

2) On Pg 969 line 20, the phrase "which allows to do the computations" does not flow naturally.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 957, 2015.