

Interactive comment on “Polyphase evolution of a crustal-scale shear zone during progressive exhumation from ductile to brittle behaviour: a case study from Calabria, Italy” by E. Fazio et al.

G. Pennacchioni (Editor)

giorgio.pennacchioni@unipd.it

Received and published: 4 May 2015

Dear authors, I have received and carefully read through the 2 reviews of your manuscript submitted for the Special Issue. The 2 reviewers made a thorough and extended report, and basically are concordant in saying that the manuscript suffer of several major flaws regarding the English style, the ms structure, the thoroughness of description, and the quality of data and conclusions. There is not a clear focus of the work both rather the ms appear as a collections of different topics (and none of them is really carefully investigated) . The data presentation is, in many, parts inaccurate and incomplete (if not wrong). Based on these reviews and on my own reading I regret

C566

to say that my final decision is: Reject on Reviews. If the authors intend to submit a new version of the current manuscript I suggest that they take into full consideration the remarks done by the reviewers. The new ms will be treated as a new submission as the requested review imply a complete rewriting of the work. As both reviewers highlighted, the rocks investigated in the study are spectacular and deserve a detailed investigation. The authors have therefore a wonderful opportunity to investigate some scientifically exciting topics, but they must select one and dig in it. Best regards Giorgio Pennacchioni

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 909, 2015.

C567