

Interactive comment on “Precision of farmer based fertility ratings and soil organic carbon for crop production on a Ferralsol” by P. Musinguzi et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 7 May 2015

The manuscript compared two procedures to assess the soil fertility : field experiences (FFE) with scientific quantitative ratings using soil organic carbon (SQR-SOC)

The paper is well structured, the study area and methodology well described.

It address to an important topic that is the need to classify the soil with alternative methods, when for economic problem, is not possible to use scientific soil analysis.

The results are interesting, but the scientific significance is poor.

The farmer field experience method can be used in general for agronomic aspects, but not to carry out scientific research. For instance, data showed as the FFE is not

C614

suitable for soil rich in organic matter content .

The authors could use the comparison of the two procedures as one part of a more complex manuscript, where the main topic could be – variation of soc content in relation to biomass production;- relation among yield and soil parameters, -evaluation Carbon steady state level.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 1237, 2015.

C615