

Interactive comment on “Volcanic soils and landslides: the case study of the Ischia island (southern Italy) and relationship with other Campania events” by S. Vingiani et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 2 February 2015

Dear Editor and Authors, I went through the manuscript sed-7-1-2015 submitted for publication in Solid Earth by Vingiani and co-authors. The paper focuses on the relationships between physical, mineralogical, hydrological and micromorphological soil properties and debris flows in a volcanic environment of Italy (Ischia Island), and emphasizes the role of soil discontinuities as factors of such mass movements. The topic is novel, very interesting and warrants publication in SE. However, some points need to be addressed before acceptance. First of all, the manuscript needs some English editing (I included some corrections in the revised ms., attached as a pdf file), and also some rephrasing where too long, verbose sentences occur. Also, the clarity of some parts, including the objectives of the research in the Abstract, need to

C9

be improved. As an example, in the abstract, a 2C horizon is dealt with without any introduction to types of soil profiles and corresponding genetic horizons. In several places, specific soil horizons are mentioned, but it is not clear to which soil profile they belong. Interpretation of data is on the whole correct. However, in some cases a more cautious (hypothetical) approach would be more suitable. Some additional or alternative explanations could be taken into consideration and properly discussed (see my comments in the attached pdf version, e.g., on role of time as a factor of development of andic/non andic properties). In places, also some more references are recommended (see annotated pdf). Based on these considerations I propose that the manuscript will be resubmitted by the Authors after a moderate revision. With best regards,

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
<http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/7/C9/2015/sed-7-C9-2015-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 1, 2015.