Solid Earth Discuss., 7, C90–C91, 2015
www.solid-earth-discuss.net/7/C90/2015/

Solid Earth
Discussions
Open Access

Interactive comment on "Soil aggregation, erodibility and erosion rates in mountain soils (NW-Alps, Italy)" *by* S. Stanchi

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 26 February 2015

General comment I agree with the body of the article through the comparison of the Erodibility (K) factor in RUSLE with soil aggregate stability indexes, it could be a useful tool to analyse soil status regarding erosion, I agree with the developed methodology. Anyway, I would like to remark that soil erosion estimation through RUSLE involves soil external factors such rain characteristics that are most important in the A RUSLE factor. In that sense, underestimating or overestimating the soil erosion through this methodology are not completely trustable since no REAL data are produced. I also stress to discuss with OWN data on the discussion section. On the attached document I made some comments overwritten in yellow. Pleased, follow. Based on the scientific significance of the article I will accepted with major revision.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/7/C90/2015/sed-7-C90-2015-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 185, 2015.