

Interactive  
Comment

***Interactive comment on “The Imbert Formation of northern Hispaniola: a tectono-sedimentary record of arc-continent collision and ophiolite emplacement in the northern Caribbean subduction-accretionary prism” by J. Escuder-Viruete et al.***

**P. Ryan (Referee)**

paul.ryan@nuigalway.ie

Received and published: 28 July 2015

General Comments:

The article, The Imbert Formation of northern Hispaniola: a tectono-sedimentary record of arc-continent collision and ophiolite emplacement in the northern Caribbean subduction-accretionary prism by J. Escuder-Viruete , A. Suárez-Rodríguez , J. Gabites , and A. Pérez-Estaún presents stratigraphic, structural, geochemical, petro-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



logical and geochronological evidence to support their contention that the Imber Formation originated as a fore-arc basin that evolved into a piggy back basin during arc-continent collision of the Caribbean Plate with the Bahama Platform. The data clearly implies that early deposits were intercalated with arc related volcanism, whilst later and coarsening upwards deposits contained deformed and metamorphosed material from the ophiolitic basement. Whilst the individual data sets are not particularly large, each supports the other in establishing their model. I believe that the conclusions reached are justified, especially because I have experience in working in lower Palaeozoic rocks which have been interpreted in a similar manner. The diagrams are clear and useful as are the references. Extra data is presented in the supplemental files. Overall, I enjoyed the article and accept the authors conclusions as being reasonable. The article reinforces the important point that orogeny can occur below sea-level.

#### Specific Comments:

I feel the article could be improved on two fronts. Firstly, the text should be run through a grammar checker. There are many minor grammatical errors, some of which I list below (see 'Technical Corrections'). EU and US spelling of metric units are used in the text, which makes me suspect that whilst the authors have each written their own sections, the final manuscript has not been copy edited by one author. In the list of corrections I also include some suggestions which might improve idiomatic usage.

The second and most important way in which I believe the article could be improved is to enlarge the discussion section. Comparison of the the Imbert Formation basin with other such basins elsewhere in the world is limited to very general terms in the last 8 lines of the article. An obvious correlative for perhaps both the Imbert Formation and the El Mamey Group would be the Ordovician South Mayo Trough of western Ireland (see Ryan and Dewey 2011 and Dewey and Mange 1999). The deformation in the fore-arc during the early stages of arc continent collision (ACC) in Taiwan is well documented (see, for example, Lin et al. 2009) as is the composition of the sediments in the basins in the ACC zone ( Yen & Lundberg 2006). A fuller discussion would widen

**SED**

7, C919–C922, 2015

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



readership and hence citations.

## Technical Corrections and Suggestions:

Key Page/Line original text = suggested correction

1828/18 coatic = chaotic 1829/05 differ of = differ from 1829/14 to a mélange = as a mélange 1829/17 deducted = deduced 1829/19 evidences = evidence 1830/17 edified = developed? 1830/20 there exist = there are 1832/29 has been = have been 1833/16 disagree = disagrees 1839/18 disposed over = overlies? 1839/26 coatic=chaotic 1840/09 carries=quarries? 1840/28 variocolored =varicoloured 1841/02 coatic=chaotic 1843/15 volcaniclastis = volcanoclastic rocks 1843/18 first use of Hbl, please define 1845/10 and no contained = and had no contained? 1846/15 caotic = chaotic 1848/24 carry = quarry 1849/07 carry =quarry 1850/13 By other hand = On the other hand? or Alternatively? 1850/26-27 A coeval syn-sedimentary tectonics is apparently absent = Evidence of coeval syn-sedimentary tectonics is absent? 1850/28 alternance of = alternating? 1851/13 unconformable = unconformably 1851/16 already srtuctured = already deformed? 1851/20 unconformably overlie = unconformably overlies 1851/23-24 rule out = ruled out 1851/28 By other hand = Also? 1852/11 results = result 1853/01 axe = axis? 1853/07 results = result 1853/20 would be presumed to be = are presumed to be? 1853/26 indicate = indicates or suggests? (indicate used in next sentence) 1854/04 the coeval sedimentation of the Imbert Fm (IM2 and IM3), as also implying = the coeval sedimentation of the Imbert Fm (IM2 and IM3), consistent with? 1854/15 relations = relationship 1854/20 coeval to = coeval with 1854/27 in a shallow = at a shallow? 1854/28-29 better as: All sections of the Imbert Fm in the RSJC are unconformably overlain by the La Toca Fm, which contains in the lowermost strata middle-to-upper 1855/26 caotic = chaotic 1856/15 agree = agrees 1856/16 as marbles = of marbles? or such as marbles? 1856/25 madure = mature 1857/02 up gradation = upwards gradation?

References:

SED

7, C919–C922, 2015

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Dewey, J.F., and Mange, M.A. 1999. Petrography of Ordovician and Silurian sediments in the western Irish Caledonides: tracers of a short-lived Ordovician continent-arc collision orogeny and the evolution of the Laurentian Appalachian-Caledonian margin. Geological Society of London Special Publication, 164: 55-107.

Lin, A T., Yao, B. Hsu, S-K, Liu, C-S, and Huang, C-Y. 2009. "Tectonic Features of the Incipient Arc-Continent Collision Zone of Taiwan: Implications for Seismicity." Tectonophysics 479 (1-2): 28–42. doi:doi: DOI: 10.1016/j.tecto.2008.11.004.

Ryan, P.D., and Dewey, J.F. 2011. Arc-continent collision in the Ordovician of western Ireland: stratigraphic, structural and metamorphic evolution. In Arc-continent collision. Edited by Brown, D. and Ryan, P.D., Frontiers in Earth Sciences, Springer Verlag, Berlin Heidelberg. pp. 373-401

Yen, J-Y, and Lundberg, N. 2006. "Sediment Compositions in Offshore Southern Taiwan and Their Relations to the Source Rocks in Modern Arc-Continent Collision Zone." Marine Geology 225 (1-4): 247–63. doi:doi: DOI: 10.1016/j.margeo.2005.09.003.

Paul D. Ryan, Galway, 27/7/15.

---

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 1827, 2015.

**SED**

7, C919–C922, 2015

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

