

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Improvements in aggregate stability of recently deposited sediments supplemented with tea waste and farmyard manure” by B. Turgut and B. Köse

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 7 August 2015

This paper discusses about the improvements in aggregate stability of sediments using farmyard manure and tea waste. The results suggested that the considered organic matter supplements increased the aggregate stability. The study area considers the accumulated sediments in a dam reservoir. The entire work leaves my rather puzzled since first, it is really difficult at the eyes of the readers to understand the real purpose of the conducted analysis. Why we need to use organic matter for increasing the aggregate stability of sediments deposited in a dam reservoir? What is the main purpose for this? Why the authors selected this specific study area (dam reservoir) and not an agricultural landscape, where soil erosion can be a critical issue? Why in the study there isn't a comparison with real case studies characterized by different soil erosion

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



rates and different soil organic matter? An analysis on an experimental area (usually required for such kind of analysis, especially when discussing about soil erosion), monitored by instruments through time scale, is also missed. Another point: farmyard manure and tea waste are just two examples, what about the other supplements? In addition, the text presents several weak sections: the methodology section, the discussion and the conclusion are really poor and short. A location map of the study area is missed. At my eyes these are really critical points that mine the entire work at its basis. Unfortunately the paper in its present form is not ready for publication.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., 7, 2037, 2015.

SED

7, C935–C936, 2015

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C936

