

Interactive comment on “Hydraulic fracturing in thick shale basins: problems in identifying faults in the Bowland and Weald Basins, UK” by David K. Smythe

F. Rossetti (Editor)

federico.rossetti@uniroma3.it

Received and published: 2 April 2016

In his SC18 (Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2015-134-SC18, 2016) on the Discussion paper SE2015-134 by Dr. D. Smythe, Dr. Westaway stated that the SE journal has provided a scientific platform to present a biased view of UK Earth Science Community and that the journal should not host similar papers in the future. As handling editor of this SE Discussion paper, I have to point out that, despite controversial and provocative in some parts, the SE2015-134 paper deserved to be handled in the same way as all the papers submitted to SE. It is online publication has stimulated a vigorous scientific debate that I consider has somehow contributed to improve the state of knowledge on the various aspects dealing with the hydraulic fracturing technique

C1

(fracking) and its applications. I would also remark that the open-access platform of SE ensures all the different opinions are adequately represented during the editorial workflow, providing a fair and unbiased review process. Finally, regarding point (1) of the SC18 of Dr. Westaway: following the SE editorial policy, as topical handling Editor of the manuscript I have the duty to censor “comments that are not of substantial nature or of direct relevance to the issues raised in the discussion paper or which contain personal insults, especially if Authors. . .notify the topical editor in case of abusive comments.” I can thus just re-iterate what I wrote in my email to Dr Westaway after having received a complaint from Dr. Smythe about his SC2: “Although I am aware that there is a vigorous debate in UK on the fracking technique that is not only confined to the scientific community, I believe that comments on scientific articles should be instead confined only to scientific issues. On this regard, I would also emphasise that comments that regards interpersonal relationships and aspects of the professional reputation of the Author (or anyone else) are to be avoided, because not in discussion here.

Federico Rossetti

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2015-134, 2016.

C2