

Interactive comment on “Cultivated grasslands present a higher soil organic carbon sequestration efficiency under leguminous than under gramineous species” by Yu Liu et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 26 October 2016

Dear Editor, I have finished the review of submitted your journal titled “Cultivated grasslands present a higher soil organic carbon sequestration efficiency under leguminous than under gramineous species” my opinion on the article is as follows: General evaluation Overall evaluation although the content of the study is relatively simple, the results were evaluated well and explanations regarding to findings successfully discussed recent literatures. The subject is the general scope of the journal also; topic is suitable for scope of Solid Earth Abstract. Abstract is informative. Properly keywords are given. The objectives of the article adequate and appropriate in view of the subject matter. Comments and suggestions for improvements Specific Concerns Introduction It is suitable and original contribution. Clearly is reflecting the contents and is relevant with

C1

subject. Material and methods Materials and methods used are suitable and scientific for this article. The description of materials and methods are to allow replication of the experiment. Results are clearly presented. Article structured is in agreement with the Guide for authors. Content justify the length. Tables are all necessary, complete and clearly presented. References are adequate. Conclusions Results and discussion are given clearly. Legends of figures need to be changed. They are currently difficultly understood. Instead of color, different characters can be used in bars Interpretations and conclusions are, justified by the data and consistent with the objectives. This is original contributes to science. Results are clearly expressed. Final Decision The paper deals with an interesting aspect and presents a wide dataset. This study is still able to add some knowledge of interest to an environmental readership. In addition, the paper contains some useful information that is worthy of publication and usefulness for other researchers in this field. In brief, my opinion is, this manuscript has been written in standard scientific way and is suitable for publication in an international journal as like Journal of Solid Earth Acceptable with minor revision, not requiring reconsideration by referee.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-109, 2016.

C2