

Interactive comment on “Estimating soil erosion risk and evaluating erosion control measures for soil conservation planning at Koga Watershed, Ethiopian Highlands” by Tegegne Molla and Biniam Sisheber

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 14 September 2016

The paper examines soil erosion in the high lands and Ethiopia and evaluates the measures implemented to diminish it. The topic is interesting and very well presented in the Introduction. However, as I kept reviewing the paper I found that a major restructure needs to be done before being publishable in Solid Earth. I only check it until p. 8 since the number and magnitude of the changes to be done is so significant that it was time wasting to continue.

The main problem is related to the structure of the paper. The Results and Discussion section present mostly the way the data was obtained, but neither PRESENT nor DIS-

C1

CUSS the data. Example: 3.3 you explain all the process to calculate it but then just 2 lines to discuss the results with no discussion. This section includes several parts (namely the beginning of subsections) which explain the methodology used in this paper. All referred to the methods implemented in this research should be moved to the Methodological section.

Then, the Results and Discussion should include the DESCRIPTION of the obtained results. What do your data show? What are the geographical patterns shown by your data? Present the values and infer patterns. After, you need to DISCUSS the factors explaining these data. What are the driving factors controlling soil erosion? You must refer to other studies that have dealt with similar topics. Are results similar/different) are the processes controlling soil erosion comparable and to what extent? Please, refer here to the existing literature on these topics.

Comments on specific sections p. 1, l. 13 “clean water and air” p. 1, l. 20 also geomorphic processes are affected p. 1, l. 22 “vegetation” p. 2, l. 9 “has been provoked” p. 2, l. 17 I don’t understand this sentence, may be “Whereas” at the beginning is not appropriate p. 2, l. 27 space needed after elevation “m”. Here and along the text. Usually the first time an altitude is mentioned you should add “above sea level” here you only mention it in the next sentence. p. 2, l. 31 rewrite this sentence, please. Maybe. . . “The lowland part of the watershed presents gentle slopes at elevations of 1880 m” p. 3, l. 3 high annual precipitations? Please give values p. 3, l. 12-17 This is methodology and should be moved there p. 4, l. 1-7 Idem p. 7, l. 2-20 Idem p. 8, l. 1-4 Idem Figure 2. The text is too small, not readable

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-120, 2016.

C2