

Interactive comment on “Nitrogen addition alters elemental stoichiometry within soil aggregates in a temperate steppe” by Jinfei Yin et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 17 October 2016

First of all, thank you for considering me as reviewer of Solid Earth.

General comments: Authors must review the journal format (justify text and references).

Introduction

Review Han et al., 2014 in references Elser, 2010 review references Elser et al., 2010??? Amezketta, 2008 must be added. Soil Aggregate Stability: A Review Wu, 2012?? or Wu et al., 2012? Wang et al., 2017 review in references

Methods Please reference Soil TAXONOMY Liu et al. 2009 correct ",

delete , after) page 9 please review ... and the saken?? or and then shaken??
page 10REWRITE IN A BETTER FORM THE FISRT PARAGRAPH In fraction >2000

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



DOC:DIN was greater in Ck and not effect on N addition was detected 5, 10, 15... 250-2000 N10 N15 and <250 only N15 COMPARE WITH CONTROL!!! Expalin NI-TROGEN CONCENTRATION PLEASE!!! Table 2 is needed???aABOUT INTERACTION BETWEEN FACTORS ARE NOT EXPLAIN!! AND YOU CAN USE f-VALUE IN THE TEXT!!! Also when you say soil DOC:AP ratio significantly decreased with N addition???but with N15???? interaction must be expalin better!!

page 11. it coul confuse. You must expalin that decreased compared with control but not differences were founb between N concentrations!!!only in small you found differences in concentrations, why????not in discussion!!!!

page 10. what happens in small aggregates???? REVIEW dU ET AL., 2014

You must discuss about N concentration!!!!!!!!!!!!!! what is the effect? what happens with pH?? ETC.... Review Treseder, 2008 in refernces N concentration in nutrients???? Review Kopittke and Menzies, 2007 Zhang and Norton, 2002 Somers and SHIVE, 1942 Tanaka and Navasero, 1966

Conclusions must be rewrite be carefull when you say N addition!! what happens with doses???

Refrences

Please review journal format

like two authors: and or not? with the last author, and???

Du, Z... REVIEW THE YEAR ALSO IN TEH TEXT!!!

FIGURES

pLEASE USE GREY INSTEAD BLACK BECAUSE YOU CAN'T SEE THE ERROR

IT IS EXTRANGE YOU DIDN'T FIND DIFERENCES IN DIN:AP 250-200 IN cK AND <250 n10 n15????

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



You must explain better in the text of the figures Ck, n, n10.....

table 2??????it is necessary??? why not draw all the correlations together???in one figure???

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-129, 2016.

SED

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

