

Interactive comment on “Soil Atterberg limits of different weathering profiles of the collapsing gullies in the hilly granitic region of south China” by Yusong Deng et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 3 January 2017

REVISION Paper: se-2016-152 Title: Soil Atterberg limits of different weathering profiles of the collapsing gullies in the hilly granitic region of south China

GENERAL COMMENTS: This study discusses the use of soil Atterberg limits in weathering profiles of four collapsing gullies located in a hilly region of South China, as an indicator for soil vulnerability and degradation in collapsing gully systems, relating them to various soil physico-chemical properties. The paper, well written and organized, is very interesting. It is also well referenced. However, in my opinion there are a few doubts related to sampling and site selection to be resolved before publishing.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS: I miss control sites that allow to use Atterberg limits or soil properties as indicators of collapsing gullies. Characteristics of weathering profiles

C1

should be compared with unaltered slopes. This would modify the statistical study.

RECOMMENDATION: Minor Revision

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-152, 2016.