

Interactive comment on “Soil Atterberg limits of different weathering profiles of the collapsing gullies in the hilly granitic region of south China” by Yusong Deng et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 3 January 2017

REVISION Paper: se-2016-152 Title: Soil Atterberg limits of different weathering profiles of the collapsing gullies in the hilly granitic region of south China

GENERAL COMMENTS: This study discusses the use of soil Atterberg limits in weathering profiles of four collapsing gullies located in a hilly region of South China, as an indicator for soil vulnerability and degradation in collapsing gully systems, relating them to various soil physic-chemical properties. The paper, well written and organized, is very interesting. It is also well referenced. However, in my opinion there are a few doubts related to sampling and site selection to be resolved before publishing.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS: I miss control sites that allow to use Atterberg limits or soil properties as indicators of collapsing gullies. Characteristics of weathering profiles

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



should be compared with unaltered slopes. This would modify the statistical study.

RECOMMENDATION: Minor Revision

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-152, 2016.

SED

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

