

Interactive comment on “Desertification in Forest, Range and Desert Landuses of Tehran Province, Under the Impact of Climate Change” by Hadi Eskandari Dameneh et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 11 March 2016

Dear authors, I have now evaluated the above-mentioned manuscript, which was submitted to Solid Earth journal. The research work tries to evaluate desertification processes in three main soil uses such as forest, range and deserts, all of them located in the Tehran Province. Also predictions using climate change scenarios are presented. The manuscript concludes that the NPP has decreased in all natural areas. The topic is within the scope of the journal and is quite interesting. The way to analyse the problem, using satellite images, is remarkable. However, I have several concerns about the research and the manuscript. First of all, the introduction section needs to be rewritten being focused on the relevant aspect of the topic presented here. Sometime is general and vague, not exposing clearly the main objectives you want to answer and the main

C1

hypothesis you want to establish. Please, try to avoid general ideas like desertification definition and so on, everyone interested on this topic knows about it. Also the study area section needs to be rewritten. More information to easily follow the research is needed. For example, historic land used and management could be useful to fully understand nowadays circumstances. The methods used are valid however more work is needed to clearly outline it. Secondly, the discussion section is short not being clearly connected with the results and the international literature available about the topic. Moreover sometimes is vague and speculative. The abstract does not provide enough details about the work undertaken. It should be improved. Finally, the manuscript needs to be reviewed by an English native speaker since a lot of language mistakes are present through the whole manuscript. I feel that with an important revision it would be suitable for publication in SE journal.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-28, 2016.

C2