

## ***Interactive comment on “Pull-apart basin tectonic model is structurally impossible for Kashmir basin, NW Himalaya” by A. A. Shah***

**F. Rossetti (Editor)**

federico.rossetti@uniroma3.it

Received and published: 21 March 2016

Dear Dr. Shah,

I have not received two independent reviews of your ms. and both converge into the evaluation that your ms. is not suitable for publication. As noted by both reviewers (and I fully agree with their views), the ms. is intended to oppose previous interpretations presented in Alam et al. (2015) rather than to present independent, self-sustained data for alternative interpretation.

Actually, the submitted ms. appears as a "comment" paper rather than a standard scientific paper. On this subject, it is worth nothing you published on January 16 2016 a comment to the Geomorphology paper by Alam et al. (2015 -Tectonic evolution of Kashmir basin in northwest Himalayas; quoted with doi:

C1

10.1016/j.geomorph.2015.03.025). Based on a comparative analysis of the two ms., overlapping is evident despite figures (but Fig. 1 is almost the same as the one in the comment) and text are somehow different. Arguments against the strike-slip hypothesis are, however, almost the same and therefore the submitted SE ms. duplicates what stated in the comment.

I therefore think your SE ms. does not add much to the scientific debate on the structural and tectonic setting of the region. Accordingly, my decision is to discourage the submission of a revised version and for ms. rejection at this stage.

Thank you for giving us the opportunity to consider your work.

Yours sincerely, federico rossetti

---

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-4, 2016.

C2