

Interactive comment on “Experimental sand burial affects seedling survivorship, morphological traits and biomass allocation of *Ulmus pumila* var. *sabulosa* in Horqin Sandy Land” by Jiao Tang et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 6 April 2016

I recommend review this work again after some improvements. I appreciate the authors clarify my doubts.

L31 “transferring more biomass to aboveground rather than belowground parts.” It is interesting, but not be well supported. I suggested to compare the above ground biomass (i.e. stem+leaf) and below ground biomass (i.e. root) respectively. The root biomass was reported in the previous version, but the mean and s.d. values were not shown in the results part.

L109 Before the start of burial treatment experiment, Is the number of seedlings in

C1

each pot same with each other? What is the number of seedlings in each pot?

L116 “Immediately after burial. . .” Does it mean after the end of burial treatment experiment?

L139 The second degree of freedom in F test could not be 235 in the experiment described in current status. Please verify it!

L147 “Height of seedlings in the control treatment of 16.28cm was significantly lower than that in the T33”. The mean value is not enough. The s.d value should be reported.

L149 The mean and s.d. values of height growth rate should be reported. L155 The mean and s.d. values of stem diameter should be reported. If it is necessary, the mean and s.d. values of other indices should be reported. It is helpful for evaluating the effects of sand burial on the growth of elm seedlings.

Technical corrections L22 “as” should not be bold

L37 “Horqin sandy land” should be “Horqin Sandy Land”

L58 A full stop is needed before “Sand movement”

L71 “Horqin sandy land” should be “Horqin Sandy Land”

L82 A comma is needed between “Maun” and “1997”.

L94 “where” should be “which”

L97 It should be 4.4 m s⁻¹

L100 “Cao et al., 2011” should not be in italics

L115 A blank space between “that” and “fresh” is unnecessary

L 123 mm.cm-1d-1 should be mm³cm⁻¹d⁻¹. Same mistakes in other place should be verified.

L139 P =0.000 should be P<0.001. The same problem exists in other place, please

C2

verify it.

L153 “Seedling stem diameter, taproot length and total leaf area” should move to the next line

L175 A blank space between “percentage” and “biomass” is unnecessary

L186 “Sand” should be sand

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-55, 2016.