

## ***Interactive comment on “Experimental sand burial affects seedling survivorship, morphological traits and biomass allocation of *Ulmus pumila* var. *sabulosa* in Horqin Sandy Land” by Jiao Tang et al.***

### **Anonymous Referee #4**

Received and published: 18 April 2016

#### **GENERAL COMMENTS:**

The work of Tang et al. compares the effects of partial and total sand burial on sandy elm seedlings: mortality, morphological traits, root allocation, etc. The study has been carried out in Horqin Sandy Land (China) where problems with wind erosion are a common feature. Results show an interesting reflection: Sandy elm seedlings are sufficiently resistant to partial burial. However actions to reduce wind erosion in this part of China are a key issue because total burial effects are largely negative.

This research could be valuable mainly by two reasons: originality and usefulness.

C1

However, in my opinion, this article is not yet worked enough to merit publication in a prestigious journal such as SOLID EARTH, at least this version. English should be checked by a native speaker. Introduction should be restructured and rewritten, and too many mistakes can be still observed in the text (please see specific comments below). Therefore, I am going to suggest to the Editor a Major Revision in order to be able to give more specific suggestions in the next version.

#### **SPECIFIC AND TECHNICAL COMMENTS:**

##### **Title**

“(China)” should be mentioned in the title.

##### **Filiations**

“Department of Resource and Environment, Henan Institute of Science and Technology” Please use capital letters always that it is possible.

##### **Abstract**

Page 1, line 22: “Abstracts” Please delete the final “s” and replace in a single row.

Page 1, line 22: “Horqin Sandy Land (China)” SE is a worldwide journal.

Page 1, line 24: “soil degradation” What is the dominant process? Wind erosion? Please be more precise. An abstract aims to simplify the reading comprehension.

Page 1, line 25: “allocation buried at different depth: unburied and seedlings buried...” Please correct it.

##### **Keywords**

Please delete “sand accretion”

##### **Introduction**

This chapter is a little disorganized, i.e. it is not easy to read. Please restructure it.

C2

Soil genesis and the role of vegetation should be written in the same paragraph.

Page 2, line 43: "cultivation around the world (Brevik...)". Please separate it.

Page 2, lines 43 and 44: "This excessive human interference changes" Please correct it

Page 2, line 45: "Gabarrón-Galeote" Please use accent marks in Latin surnames.

Page 2, lines 46-51: "These sentences should be written more forward in the Introduction section". It does not make any sense speaking about soil genesis, Horqin Sandy Land and the role of vegetation. Please be consistent.

Page 2, line 46: "Horqin Sandy Land is located" Please correct it.

Page 2, line 47: "China (Qiu, 1989)" Please separate it (throughout the text, it is a common mistake).

Page 2, lines 52 and 53: "vegetation plays an important role controlling soil genesis and degradation in fragile ecosystems such as estuarine, desert or sandy land" Please correct it.

Page 2, line 53: "Cerdà" Please use accent marks in Latin surnames.

Pages 2 and 3, lines 54-56: "Please remove these lines. They are superfluous"

Page 3, line 57: "Here it should begin the second paragraph of the Introduction section".

Page 3, line 57: "In sandy ecosystems, instability of the soil surface is one of the most destructive factors. Furthermore, sparse vegetation coverage and loose soil texture are highly susceptible..." Please correct it.

Page 3, line 62: "development (Li...)" Please separate it.

Page 3, line 62: "An increasing" Please correct it. That should be the beginning of a third paragraph.

### C3

Page 3, line 65: "), and reproduction" Please separate it.

Page 3, line 67: "following growth (Maun, 1997)" Please separate it.

Page 3, line 68: ";" however" Please separate it.

Page 3, line 71: Idem

Page 4, lines 74 and 76: Idem

Material and methods

Study site

Page 5, line 94: "480 m a.s.l.) located in..." Please correct it.

Number and units should be separated.

Places do not belong to any climate. They are characterized or dominated by some types of climate. Please correct it.

Experimental methods

Page 5, line 102: "from multiple mature individuals" Please correct it.

Page 5, line 105: "0.5 – 1.0 cm" Please separate number and units.

Page 5, line 106: "sandy elm (Tang et al., 2016)" Please separate text and citation

Page 6, line 110: Idem

Calculations

What does it mean each unit: e.g. mm.cm-1d-1?

Results

In my opinion, there are too many sub-chapters. Furthermore, sometimes figures are not mentioned or bad mentioned in the text (e.g. figure 1, page 8) and some tables

### C4

could be useful for readers.

Number and units, text and parenthesis, etc. should be separated (throughout the text).

Page 8, line 153: The title of a sub-chapter should be presented in a single row

Page 8, line 156: Why do you use cm in some cases and mm in other cases?

Discussion

It should be checked by a native speaker. There are too many grammar and style mistakes.

References

They are presented in a different style: font, interlines, etc.

---

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-55, 2016.