

Interactive comment on “Combined effects of grain size, flow volume and channel width on geophysical flow mobility: 3-D discrete element modeling of dry and dense flows of angular rock fragments” by Bruno Cagnoli and Antonio Piersanti

MSc. van Dinther

ylona.vandinther@erdw.ethz.ch

Received and published: 22 September 2016

Based on an initial scan of the manuscript I noted distinct similarity and repetition of results obtained in your 2015 JGR paper. Grain size and flow volume were already studied in detail there, so I do not see the point to repeat too large quantities from that study. Besides large quantities of text (19% of the text resembles your 2015 study according to the similarity report), I also see several figures and tables are exactly the same (e.g., Fig. 1,2, and 4), while all other figures are also very similar to your JGR

C1

2015 paper. In my opinion such large amounts of overlap is surely not warranted in scientific publications.

Additionally, it seems that in your “new” scaling parameter you only replace the length scale in the denominator from width * width to width * length. Is this correct? If so, I would acknowledge that within the paper and tune down the formulation. I would say it is a (small) update of a scaling parameter.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-79, 2016.

C2