

Interactive comment on “The effectiveness of jute and coir erosion control blankets in different field and laboratory conditions” by J. Kalibová et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 20 February 2016

This manuscript presents data that is important in addressing issues with the use of geotextiles. The study is interesting and innovative, particularly in the lab study with no soil base. There are some presentation issues with this manuscript. It needs to be carefully edited by a native English speaker or an English editing service. The authors also have several one sentence paragraphs, this should be avoided. One sentence paragraphs need to be combined with the paragraphs before or after them as appropriate, or expanded such that they have at least 3-4 sentences in them. The paper needs to have consistent verb tense use, traditionally scientific papers are written in the past tense.

Lines 31-32 – I suggest adding Yuan et al. (2015) to the list of references here.

Line 36 – I suggest adding Ola et al. (2015) and Keesstra et al. (2016) to the Rickson


Printer-friendly version


Discussion paper





(2006) reference.

Line 48 – Giménez-Morera et al. 2009 should be 2010. 

Lines 52-59 – Most of this information belongs in the Materials and Methods section. 


Lines 60-65 – Most of this information belongs in the Discussion section. 

Line 61 – Beven, 2012 should be 2011. 

Line 92 – A reference is needed for the hydrometer method used. While all hydrometer methods share common traits, there is more than one. 

Line 94 – How was organic matter determined? No method is given. 

Line 106 – How was volumetric water content determined? No method is given. 

There are several areas (e.g., Lines 134-138, 144-147, 152-155) where long lines of numbers are given as results, but the long number lists are difficult to read and digest. These would be better presented in tables. 



The fact that the Welch two sample t-test was used is repeated multiple times in the Results section (e.g., Line 144, 151). This was already stated in the Materials and Methods section. There is no need to repeat it over again in the Results, and certainly no need to repeat it multiple times. 

Figure 1 – Solid Earth will publish in color at no charge, and this figure would be much better in color.

Figure 2 – Solid Earth will publish in color at no charge, and this figure would be much better in color. 

References

Keesstra, S., Pereira, P., Novara, A., Brevik, E.C., Azorin-Molina, C., Parras-Alcántara, L., Jordán, A., Cerdà, A. 2016. Effects of soil management techniques on soil water erosion in apricot orchards. Science of the Total Environment 551-552, 357-366.

Ola, A., Dodd, I.C., Quinton, J.N. 2015. Can we manipulate root system architecture to control soil erosion? SOIL 1, 603-612. doi:10.5194/soil-1-603-2015.

Yuan, Y., Jiang, Y., Taguas, E.V., Mbonimpa, E.G., Hu, W. 2015. Sediment loss and its cause in Puerto Rico watersheds. SOIL 1, 595-602. doi:10.5194/soil-1-595-2015.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-8, 2016.

SED

Interactive
comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

