

Interactive comment on “Effects of topsoil treatments on afforestation in a dry-Mediterranean climate (southern Spain)” by P. Hueso-González et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 18 August 2016

GENERAL COMMENTS

This paper studies the effects of topsoil treatments on afforestation in a dry mediterranean climate in Spain.

The manuscript represents an interesting paper, with many interesting data. However, I consider that major changes should be addressed, and some problems should be solved before a new revision in Solid Earth journal.

The scientific approach and applied methods are valid. However there are some key points that should be highlighted

1. In my opinion, there is an important limitation in the results and discussion section.

C1

This section should be re-organized because in its present form, sometimes is really difficult to understand which are the main results.

2. One of the key points is the statistical analysis. First of all, you should indicate if your dataset is normal (normality test) so you can carry out parametric or non-parametric analysis. It is not specified in the manuscript.

3. Then you should specify and clarify your statistical results in the text in a better way (check PDF).

4. Moreover, you only analyzed the differences between amendments and the control plot, but maybe it should be also interesting to evaluate the differences between the different amendments.

5. Different comments have been added in the PDF (See also PDF)

6. There are different problems and small mistakes in the reference list and references in the manuscript. It should be checked and improved.

Figures and tables

1. I consider that most of the figures, figure captions and tables should be improved (see PDF)

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/se-2016-98/se-2016-98-RC1-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., doi:10.5194/se-2016-98, 2016.

C2