

***Interactive comment on “Assessment of Soil Erosion Vulnerability in the Heavily Populated and Ecologically Fragile Communities in Motozintla De Mendoza, Chiapas, Mexico” by Selene B. González-Morales et al.***

**Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 7 December 2017

The study falls within the scope of Solid Earth. The paper is interesting, but it is not written well to explain results. There are numerous amendments and explanations required. The introduction is too wordy and contain general statements instead actual knowledge about specific drivers of land degradation. Also, there is lack of novelty of this study. Although authors collected the interesting results of erosion by water in several districts of Mexico, this data deserves better explanation. This is main fault of the paper. Furthermore, please check again the model...the erosion rates from 200 to 1200 t/ha per year seems unreal. Without comparison of soil erosion results with

C1

soil texture characteristics and parameters used in RUSLE model findings of authors represent a good report, but less scientific paper. When updating, please discuss the results regarding the texture, slope, slope length, cover crop and OM concentration. Also, focus of the manuscript should be on erosion, not KAP survey. Some statements and conclusions are well known from earlier literature. I can not recommend this paper for publication in this condition.

Specific comments are attached in pdf.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/se-2017-85/se-2017-85-RC2-supplement.pdf>

---

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2017-85>, 2017.

C2