Solid Earth Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2018-41-EC3, 2018
© Author(s) 2018. This work is distributed under
the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.

Solid Earth
Discussions
Open Access
EGU

Interactive comment on "Permian plume beneath Tarim from receiver functions" *by* Lev Vinnik et al.

Dr Beghein (Editor)

cbeghein@epss.ucla.edu

Received and published: 18 July 2018

A rigorous and objective scientific paper should discuss and/or test all possible hypotheses. If some hypotheses have been dismissed by others in previous papers, it does not mean that your own data are incompatible with these other hypotheses. If they are, it is still worth discussing in a sentence or two of sentences for completeness.

I strongly suggest you include a short discussion on this subject so that I can make a decision about this manuscript. Thank you.

Dr. Caroline Beghein, SE Topical Editor

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2018-41, 2018.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper