Solid Earth Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2019-124-RC2, 2019 © Author(s) 2019. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



Interactive comment on "The relaxation of residual inclusion pressure and implications to Raman-thermobarometry" by Xin Zhong et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 5 November 2019

I apologize for the delay of the review process but I had to many administrative issues to deal with first. The manuscript is actually one of those that make the review process very easy. It is well-written, it has weâĂŤorganized structure and the addresses a timely topic with a novel approach. On top what referee #1 has been already mentioned, I only have suggestions, basically no real criticism.

I like the way the authors explain the methods in chapter 2. And finally discuss the most important findings of the study in a reasonable detail. I would only suggest to spent less words on the "distance to surface" issue (chapter 3.2) as this is not really new, but focusing more on the "over-" and "underestimation" of the pressure depending on the PT paths the samples take. This is really exciting and should be highlighted even more.

C1

To me the authors could consider to keep the inclusion-host relationship a bit broader in the begin of the introduction, such as considering inclusions in a bit broader context (see Farber et al 2014 CMP, for instance), but this may result in a less sharp structure.

Kind regards

 $Interactive\ comment\ on\ Solid\ Earth\ Discuss.,\ https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2019-124,\ 2019.$