

Interactive comment on “Soil-landscape relationship in sandstone-gneiss topolithosequence in Amazonas, Brazil” by Julimar da Silva Fonseca et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 18 February 2020

General comment The paper needs major changes. The English must be reviewed. Besides the recent references, there is a general absence of international citations and the authors are highly advised to adopt it. The goals are not clear. The study area must be in one specific chapter. The figures must be improved together with the inclusion of a schematic log of the sedimentary profiles. In the paper is not clear how is divided the landscape, please demonstrated in the methods. Please, reclassify landscape segments based on real landscape elements (topographical, biogeographical, geomorphological); upper third and lower third are not landscape units. There are no discussion chapter in the manuscript and therefore the results must be divided from the explanation information.

Specific comments L14-16 – Please, make it easier to understand? L 17 – In “the” Amazonas. Please, consider this comment to all the manuscript. L18 – Can you please give elevation values? L18 – I don’t understand the expression “softer” here. Is missing something. L18 – Are you sure that is 9.253 m? In English, the point (.) is decimal separator and not a thousand separator. L20 – Were used to..? L29-L30 – reference needed L30-L32 - reference needed L32-L34 – the sentence must be improved. Too much ideas, please make it simple. L37 – Is this reference the only one supporting the scientific statement in case? Please, classical references are also valid. L37-40 – Ideas are not well connected. L42 – Is it Campos et al, 2012 the only one to refer this affirmation? L42-43 – I don’t understand the sentence: “Thus, the relief, although considered a supporting factor...”. Please, rephrase. L59 – Avoid the same word twice in one sentence. L66-67 – Please give us specific goals of the paper. L68 – The characterization of the physical environment (or your study area) should not be included in the material or method. Please, give a specific chapter for the studied area. L70-L72 – I don’t know this code means. Please, rephrase according with coordinates, river basins and elevations. Main cities can also be included. L74-75 – Please, provide the information about the collection data: station and collection period. Figure 1: • The resolution must be improved; • Please, give a hierarchical organization to the tree images (A, B, C); • Graphical scale is missing the tree images; • The aerial map has no toponomy information, please provided; • Please use all the space possible on the image frame; • In the upper right image, information is confused. Please, highlight only what is important. • Legend must be improved: all the information must have the same letter number; there are two elements (Amazonas and Municipalities – AM) to the same symbology. L79-81 – Two much ideas in the same sentence. Please, divide in two main sentences: upper and lower areas. L79-80 – Please, avoid redundant information. Delete “which exhibit flat topographic surfaces”. L84 –References must be improved. Are you sure that these documents are called BRASIL or ZEE? Please, find the entity of the name of the national report to be more specific. Please confirm that there isn’t further work

on geology of biogeography/ecology in the study area? L85 – This sentence can be improved Figure 2: “Please, organize the images of the figure: A, B, C.” Please, make a figure frame. L90 – Sure that is only 9 m? The figure shows 9253 m. Please confirm the “.” and follow the figure example; From the top of? Hills, plateau, ridges, mountains? Figure 3: “Please, show the meaning of those codes.” You can exaggerate the topography in order to better understand the different units of the relief. L97 – What is the criteria used to divide the landscape in those groups? Please, show landscape elements to cluster it. L98-104 – Please, you are still in the methodology, do not give information about your results here. This must go to results. Can you create a simple table with this information (coord.; topographical position; code.; elevation; depth; samples collected in each profile) to facilitate the interpretation? L104-107 – Again, please no information about the results. L148 – Please, during this chapter, provide only information extracted from the application of your methodology. The citations along the results should be considered to include another chapter called “Discussion”. L150 – Which locality? Please, be specific. L151-512 – Please, remove “action that occurs”. L153 – Which times? Please, be specific. L153-154 – This is not the result of your paper; this is the discussion. Besides that, please connect ideas in the discussion, you should show how the lowest terrain where floods occur (food plain) is connect with the hypothetical units of the hillsides proposed by Dalrymple et al., (1968). L155 – I would take “and mapped”. L156-157 – Please, I don’t understand it. If it’s hillside, how can be represented by the top? Those are different geomorphological units. Please, clarify: upper areas? highest section? L157-159 – You are already explaining but you still didn’t show me the results. This is the discussion. L159 – Transport foothill? I don’t know what it means. Please, rectify. L162 – Remove “than the top”. L164 – Again, show first the results. L165 – The word “evidence” do not have plural in English. L166-170 – Why? Please, first, show the results. L171 – An important part of this subchapter is where you show the results. L204-209 – Discussion Table 1: This information can be transfer to a schematic log of the sedimentary profiles. In the depth there are “+” and “+”, are they different? Please

homogenize the information. L302 – An important part of this subchapter is where you show the results. L333 – Please, homogenize the citations. Now is with capital letters? Table 2: These results can be transfer to a schematic log of the sedimentary profiles. L334 – Correct it please. L337-338 – Discussion. L413 – Correct it please. 446-459 – Please, I advise to add initial space to each reference. Organize accordingly to the journal guidelines

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/se-2019-131/se-2019-131-RC2-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2019-131>, 2019.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

