

Interactive comment on “On the self-regulating effect of grain size evolution in mantle convection models: Application to thermo-chemical piles” by Jana Schierjott et al.

Julien Aubert (Editor)

aubert@ipgp.fr

Received and published: 6 February 2020

I have now read through the replies to referee comments and the revised manuscript. The authors have done their best to answer most of the referee comments, but at the same time they do themselves acknowledge that several intrinsic problems of readability, conciseness and focus were not completely solved. One of these difficulties is in particular tied to the fact that there is another related manuscript in preparation, which raised difficulties to find the focus of the present manuscript.

I do however believe that the revision efforts are significant and the paper is a worthy addition to the topic and would consider it suitable for publication in SE as it now stands.

C1

For future submissions I would encourage the authors to be more specific in their replies to referees, in particular by systematically mentioning the precise locations where changes are introduced in the text. Statement such as 'we have rewritten part of this section' are too vague and do not facilitate the evaluation of the improvements.

Please now submit the final manuscript so that I can proceed to acceptance.

Julien Aubert Topical Editor

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2019-160>, 2019.

C2