

Interactive comment on “Deciphering tectonic, eustatic and surface controls on the 20 Ma-old Burdigalian transgression recorded in the Upper Marine Molasse in Switzerland” by Philippos Garefalakis and Fritz Schlunegger

Kei Ogata (Referee)

kei.ogata@gmail.com

Received and published: 14 March 2019

Dear Editor,

The paper represent a broadband reappraisal of the Alpine Molasse basin through the implementation of different stratigraphic techniques in order to illustrate different scenarios from the lithospheric to the basin scale. Although the large amount of processed material, bibliographic review and some interesting considerations, the overall manuscript reads quite poorly and the overall message struggle to pass through. The

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)



main issues are: 1) unclear subdivision between original data and literature, 2) mixed results-interpretations, 3) poor logic organisation and structure, 4) too long and complicated sentencing and paragraphing, 5) poor graphical support, 6) unclear link between presented data and interpretations, and 7) unbalanced manuscript-supplementary material. These and several other points are detailed in annotated pdf attached.

Sincerely, Kei Ogata

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<https://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/se-2019-27/se-2019-27-RC1-supplement.zip>

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2019-27>, 2019.

[Printer-friendly version](#)

[Discussion paper](#)

