

Interactive comment on “Uncertainty in regional estimates of capacity for carbon capture and storage” by Mark Wilkinson and Debbie Polson

Ran Calvo (Referee)

rani.calvo@gsi.gov.il

Received and published: 7 April 2019

I have read this manuscript with a lot of interest. The presented work is brilliant in its simplicity. Take few students, give them a questionnaire of 3-4 questions (area and thickness or total volume, N:G, and porosity). Calculate total capacity, calculate some statistical values, summarize it and you got a nice paper. My main concern is regarding to the amount of questionnaires in this study. To my humble opinion seven students are not enough to get the full range and not enough to calculate distribution of parameters. Apart for that, excellent work.

Specific remarks: Line 41: Wilkinson et al., 2013. In the bibliographic list I can see only 2010. Line 47: Calvo et al., 2019 is missing in your bibliographic list. Line 54: Medina

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



et al., 2011 is missing in your bibliographic list. Line 102: I think it will be nice to know how many students are in this study. From your supplementary material I understood that only 7 experts are in this study. In that matter, dose 7 experts are sufficient to conduct such statistically examination? Line 108: You have an extra footnote (1). Line 110: replace "ratio), using the product" into "ratio). The product". Line 120: What are the references #14 and #15? Line 153: Cameron et al., 1990 is missing in your bibliographic list. Line 159: Usually Formation (capital F) and nut just formation. Line 269: Change & into "and". Lien 320: (e.g. 1). What it that? Figure 3: You can add the names of all aquifers.

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2019-45>, 2019.

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

