Interactive comment on "Fluid–rock interactions in the shallow Mariana forearc: carbon cycling and redox conditions" *by* Elmar Albers et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

This is a very interesting paper that contributes much to the better understanding of carbon cycle in subduction zones. The paper is well written and rather easy to follow. It is also suitable for the audience of Solid Earth.

However, I have one major comment on the trace element data. I think the data should be discusses more in detail. In particularly there is no mention to the trace element composition of the coexisting phase in the veins. That would help to better understand the presented data.

I recommend that moderate revisions are needed prior to publication.

I hope the comments are clear and useful.

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
https://www.solid-earth-discuss.net/se-2019-51/se-2019-51-RC1-supplement.pdf