Solid Earth Discuss.,
https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2020-186-RC2, 2021

Solid Earth Discussions
Open Access
EGU

Interactive comment on "Evidence for the Late Cretaceous Asteroussia event in the Gondwanan los basement terranes" *by* Sonia Yeung et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 15 February 2021

Dear Editor, dear Sonia Yeung and Co-authors,

First of all, I did not finalize the review until the discussion part, because I think the manuscript has to be rewritten fundamentally. My impression is, that the co-authors either did not check the manuscript in terms of literacy, organization and presentation or their comments were not acknowledged. The manuscript is poorly prepared, has language issues that make reading difficult, it is not concise and explicit, it has incomplete and illegible figures, figure captions, and the tables are improperly formatted. The structure of the manuscript is not clear. The separation between original and recycled data is not clear. Many statements about mineral chemistry remain unproven or not documented. Analytical errors are not shown in the mineral chemistry graphs. The tectonic background, introducing and differentiating between several deformation (D1,

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

D2, ect) events and the assignment of the different mineral generations (wm1, wm2, ect.) to those events is not done. A proper structural map or cross section is missing. The methodology is pooly described in terms of sample preparation, sample size, cleaning and measuring procedure (e.g., blank values and standard age values are not reported). In many paragraphs the headings are misleading and do not fit to the text. Therefore, I stopped before adding comments to the discussion section. In general, I do think the manuscript is suitable for a publication in SOLID EARTH and I do think after an intense rework, by the co-authors in the first place, it can make a substantial contribution to the scientific discussion.

All the best, Anonymous Reviewer 1

Please also note the supplement to this comment:
https://se.copernicus.org/preprints/se-2020-186/se-2020-186-RC2-supplement.pdf

Interactive comment on Solid Earth Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/se-2020-186, 2020.