

To Guillem Gisbert et al.,

Thank you for your submission "Vectors to ore in replacive VMS deposits of the northern Iberian Pyrite Belt: mineral zoning, whole rock geochemistry, and use of portable XRF" to the Solid Earth special issue for State of the art in mineral exploration. The manuscript has been reviewed by two experts in great detail. Overall, the reviewers emphasise the importance of the study for mineral exploration, praise the scientific merit and general story of the contribution. Both reviewers also note areas of improvement that can be made to the writing style and structure of the presentation, and suggest areas of improvement relating to the use of supplementary material, pXRF data and core photographs. I agree with the comments made by the reviewers, and suggest minor corrections can be made to the layout of the paper to improve it's clarification for a wider audience.

Both reviewers have provided general feedback and line-by-line corrections which should bring the written quality up to a higher standard. Both have also suggested ways to improve the layout of the paper, which I will leave to the authors to decide which and how to follow (either by focusing on one particular suggestion or integrating the ideas of both reviewers to improve the flow of the manuscript). Shortening in places and a clearer breakdown of headings and subheadings for the results and discussion will go a long way to addressing these concerns. It is also noted that the pXRF data could be better utilised within the main text. Although this probably seems contradictory to the "please shorten" narrative, it would be beneficial to bring some of the supplementary pXRF information into the text, such as an additional figure and more integration into the results and discussion.

Thank you again for your submission to Solid Earth and State of the art in mineral exploration, and I look forward to reading the revised version.

Kind regards,

Dr. Liam Bullock

Guest Editor for Solid Earth Special issue | State of the art in mineral exploration
University of Oxford